

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:16-cv-00016-RJS**

Spadaro v. United States Customs and Border Protection et al  
Assigned to: Judge Richard J. Sullivan  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 01/04/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Saro Spadaro**

represented by **David John Clark**  
Epstein, Becker & Green, P.C. (New York)  
250 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10177  
212-351-4500  
Fax: 212-878-8772  
Email: [dclark@ebglaw.com](mailto:dclark@ebglaw.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Matthew Savage Aibel**  
Epstein Becker & Green, P.C.(NY)  
250 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10177  
(212)-351-4814  
Fax: (212)-351-8600  
Email: [maibel@ebglaw.com](mailto:maibel@ebglaw.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Robert S. Groban , Jr.**  
Epstein, Becker & Green, P.C.  
250 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10177-1211  
(212) 351-4500  
Fax: (212)-878-8689  
Email: [rgroban@ebglaw.com](mailto:rgroban@ebglaw.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**United States Customs and Border Protection**

represented by **Stephen Seungkun Cha-Kim**  
United States Attorney's Office  
Southern District Of New York  
86 Chambers Street, Third Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2768  
Fax: 212-637-2702  
Email: [Stephen.Cha-Kim@usdoj.gov](mailto:Stephen.Cha-Kim@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Jennifer Ann Jude**  
United States Attorney's Office SDNY  
86 Chambers St., 3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
(212)-637-2663  
Fax: (212)-637-2686  
Email: [jennifer.jude@usdoj.gov](mailto:jennifer.jude@usdoj.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant****United States Department of State**represented by **Stephen Seungkun Cha–Kim**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Jennifer Ann Jude**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Defendant****Federal Bureau of Investigation**represented by **Jennifer Ann Jude**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Defendant****United States Citizenship and  
Immigration Services**represented by **Stephen Seungkun Cha–Kim**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Jennifer Ann Jude**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Defendant****United States Department of Justice**represented by **Stephen Seungkun Cha–Kim**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Jennifer Ann Jude**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/04/2016	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of State. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208–11793992)Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 –15, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 16 – 30)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>3</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Federal Bureau of Investigation, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>4</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>5</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to United States Customs and Border Protection, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>6</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to United States

		Department of State, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>7</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Civil Process Clerk, U.S. Attorney's Office for the Southern District of New York, Civil Division, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/04/2016	<u>8</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST PDF ERROR – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Loretta E. Lynch, Attorney General of the United States, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) Modified on 1/5/2016 (pc). (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/05/2016		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING CASE OPENING STATISTICAL ERROR CORRECTION: Notice to attorney Robert S. Groban, Jr.. The following case opening statistical information was erroneously selected/entered: County code New York. The following correction(s) have been made to your case entry: the County code has been modified to XX Out of U.S. (pc)</b> (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney Robert S. Groban, Jr.. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: Saro Spadaro. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party text was omitted. (pc)</b> (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney to RE–FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>7</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>6</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>8</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>4</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>5</u> Request for Issuance of Summons,. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): Caption title must exactly match what is listed on the complaint. No acronyms. Civil Process Clerk and Loretta E. Lynch are not parties listed on the complaint or on ECF. (pc)</b> (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (pc) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016		Magistrate Judge Kevin Nathaniel Fox is so designated. (pc) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016		Case Designated ECF. (pc) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>9</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David John Clark on behalf of Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>10</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Federal Bureau of Investigation, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) Modified on 1/6/2016 (dgo). (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>11</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Federal Bureau of Investigation, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>12</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Customs and Border Protection, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>13</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Department of State, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) (Entered: 01/05/2016)

01/05/2016	<u>14</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Clark, David) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/06/2016	<u>15</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Federal Bureau of Investigation. (dgo) (Entered: 01/06/2016)
01/06/2016	<u>16</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (dgo) (Entered: 01/06/2016)
01/06/2016	<u>17</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (dgo) (Entered: 01/06/2016)
01/06/2016	<u>18</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Department of State, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (dgo) (Entered: 01/06/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>19</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. United States Customs and Border Protection served on 1/7/2016, answer due 1/28/2016. Service was made by Certified Mail. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service)(Clark, David) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>20</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. United States Department of State served on 1/7/2016, answer due 1/28/2016. Service was made by Certified Mail. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service)(Clark, David) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>21</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. Federal Bureau of Investigation served on 1/7/2016, answer due 1/28/2016. Service was made by Certified Mail. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service)(Clark, David) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>22</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. United States Citizenship and Immigration Services served on 1/7/2016, answer due 1/28/2016. Service was made by Certified Mail. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service)(Clark, David) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/25/2016	<u>23</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Robert S. Groban, Jr on behalf of Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 01/25/2016)
01/26/2016	<u>24</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer Ann Jude on behalf of Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of State. (Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/26/2016)
01/27/2016	<u>25</u>	ORDER: Initial Conference set for 3/16/2016 at 10:30 AM in Courtroom 905, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/27/2016) (kgo) (Entered: 01/27/2016)
02/10/2016	<u>26</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/10/2016)
03/02/2016	<u>27</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR</b> AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice.Document filed by Saro Spadaro. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20 to the Amended Complaint, #

		<u>21</u> Exhibit 21 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29 to the Amended Complaint, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30 to the Amended Complaint)(Groban, Robert) Modified on 3/3/2016 (pc). (Entered: 03/02/2016)
03/03/2016		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney Robert S. Groban, Jr. to RE-FILE re: Document No. <u>27</u> Amended Complaint, , , , , . The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected; opposing party did not consent to the amendment of the pleading; Court's leave has not been granted . Re-file the pleading using the event type Amended Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents – attach the correct signed PDF – select the individually named filer/filers – select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against . File the Exhibit to Pleading event found under the event list Other Documents and attach either opposing party's written consent or Court's leave. (pc)</b> Modified on 3/4/2016 (pc). (Entered: 03/03/2016)
03/09/2016	<u>28</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr., and Jennifer Jude dated March 9, 2016 re: Jointly Submitted Case Management Plan And Scheduling Order. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Case Management Plan And Scheduling Order)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 03/09/2016)
03/10/2016	<u>29</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.Document filed by Saro Spadaro. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1–15, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 16–31, # <u>3</u> Stipulation Pursuant to FRCP 15 Permitting Amended Complaint)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 03/10/2016)
03/16/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: On March 16, 2016 at 10:35am , the Court held an initial conference in this matter. Attorneys David Clark and Robert Groban, Jr., present for Plaintiff. AUSA Jennifer Jude present for Defendants. Court reporter present. By June 17, 2016, the parties shall submit a joint status letter apprising the Court of the status of document production and how the parties propose to proceed. (Ruff, Robert) Modified on 3/16/2016 (ca). (Entered: 03/16/2016)
03/16/2016	<u>30</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT, by June 17, 2016, the parties shall submit a joint status letter apprising the Court of the status of Defendants' document production and how the parties propose to proceed. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/16/2016) (ama) (Entered: 03/16/2016)
03/23/2016	<u>31</u>	ANSWER to <u>29</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/23/2016)
03/24/2016	<u>32</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 3/16/2016 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Andrew Walker, (212) 805–0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/18/2016. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/28/2016. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/27/2016.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2016)
03/24/2016	<u>33</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 3/16/16 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2016)

06/17/2016	<u>34</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated June 17, 2016 re: status of Defendants' document productions and how the parties propose to proceed. Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/17/2016)
06/17/2016	<u>35</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>34</u> Letter filed by Saro Spadaro. ENDORSEMENT: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT, by August 15, 2016, the parties shall submit a joint letter apprising the Court of the status of Defendants' document productions and how the parties propose to proceed. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/17/2016) (mro) (Entered: 06/20/2016)
08/15/2016	<u>36</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr., and Jennifer Jude dated August 15, 2016 re: Status of Defendants' Document Productions And How The Parties Propose to Proceed. Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 08/15/2016)
08/15/2016	<u>37</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>36</u> Letter regarding status of Defendants' Document Productions And How The Parties Propose to Proceed, filed by Saro Spadaro. ENDORSEMENT: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the government shall complete its production by October 31, 2016. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 8/15/2016) (tro) (Entered: 08/16/2016)
10/31/2016	<u>38</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Complete Document Production</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Jennifer Jude dated 10/31/16. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/31/2016)
11/01/2016	<u>39</u>	ORDER granting <u>38</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the government's deadline to complete document production is extended to November 14, 2016. On the same date, the parties shall submit a joint letter proposing next steps in this matter. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 11/1/2016) (mro) (Entered: 11/02/2016)
11/14/2016	<u>40</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Jennifer Jude dated 11/14/16 re: Case Status and Proposal. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/14/2016)
11/14/2016	<u>41</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>40</u> Letter re: Case Status and Proposal, filed by United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Investigation. ENDORSEMENT: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall submit a joint letter by December 9, 2016 updating the Court on the status of their negotiations and proposing next steps. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 11/14/2016) (cla) (Entered: 11/15/2016)
12/09/2016	<u>42</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Jennifer Jude dated 12/9/16 re: Status Update and Proposal. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 12/09/2016)
12/09/2016	<u>43</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>42</u> Letter re: Status Update and Proposal, filed by United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Investigation. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 12/9/2016) (cla) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/20/2016	<u>44</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated December 20, 2016 re: Status Update and Proposed Briefing Schedule. Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Clark, David) (Entered: 12/20/2016)
12/21/2016	<u>45</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>44</u> Letter filed by Saro Spadaro ENDORSEMENT: Pursuant to Rule 2.A of the Court's Individual Rules and Practices, parties must submit a pre-motion letter before filing any motion not listed in the rule's exceptions. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT any party who wishes to make a

		motion for summary judgment shall file a pre-motion letter by March 13, 2017, setting forth the basis for the anticipated motion as required by Rule 2.A, and any party opposing the anticipated motion shall file a response by March 16, 2017. (Motions due by 3/13/2017., Responses due by 3/16/2017) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 12/21/2016) (cf) (Entered: 12/22/2016)
03/09/2017	<u>46</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Pre-Motion Letter</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Jennifer Jude dated 3/9/17. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Investigation, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Jude, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/09/2017)
03/09/2017	<u>47</u>	ORDER granting <u>46</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time: The government's request is GRANTED. The deadline to file a pre-motion letter for summary judgment is extended to April 21, 2017. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/9/2017) (jwh) (Entered: 03/09/2017)
04/20/2017	<u>48</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Stephen Seungkun Cha-Kim on behalf of United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 04/20/2017)
04/20/2017	<u>49</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference <i>in Advance of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 4/20/2017. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 04/20/2017)
04/20/2017	<u>50</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>49</u> LETTER MOTION for Conference <i>in Advance of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 4/20/2017 filed by United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: Pursuant to the Court's Individual Rules and Practices, Rule 2.A, Plaintiff shall file a letter response to Defendants' pre-motion letter by Tuesday, April 25, 2017. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/20/2017) (ras) (Entered: 04/20/2017)
04/21/2017	<u>51</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference re: <u>49</u> LETTER MOTION for Conference <i>in Advance of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 4/20/2017. addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated April 21, 2017. Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 04/21/2017)
04/22/2017	<u>52</u>	ORDER granting <u>51</u> Letter Motion for Conference Pre-Motion Conference set for 5/4/2017 at 12:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties shall appear for a pre-motion conference on their contemplated cross-motions for summary judgment on Thursday, May 4, 2017 at 12:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/22/2017) (ras) (Entered: 04/24/2017)
05/04/2017	<u>53</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Matthew Savage Aibel on behalf of Saro Spadaro. (Aibel, Matthew) (Entered: 05/04/2017)
05/08/2017		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 5/4/2017. Government's motion for summary judgment due by June 15, 2017; Plaintiff's cross-motion due by August 14, 2017; government's reply, if it chooses to submit one, due by August 28, 2017; Plaintiff's reply, if it chooses to submit one, due by September 11, 2017. (Kelley, Mark) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
06/12/2017	<u>54</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Motion for Summary Judgment</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha-Kim dated June 12, 2017. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 06/12/2017)
06/13/2017	<u>55</u>	ORDER granting <u>54</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Defendants' request for an extension of time to file a motion for summary judgment, and for leave to file a memorandum of law of up to 35 pages in length, is GRANTED. Defendants' brief is

		due by July 14, 2017, Plaintiff's cross-motion and response is due by September 15, 2017, Defendants' reply is due by September 29, 2017, and Plaintiff's reply is due by October 13, 2017. So Ordered. (Cross Motions due by 9/15/2017. Motions due by 7/14/2017.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/13/17) (yv) (Entered: 06/13/2017)
06/13/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 9/15/2017. Replies due by 10/13/2017. (yv) (Entered: 06/13/2017)
07/12/2017	<u>56</u>	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Affidavits and Exhibits addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha-Kim dated July 12, 2017. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/12/2017)
07/13/2017	<u>57</u>	ORDER granting <u>56</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Document. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the government may file nine affidavits in support of its motion for summary judgment, and that the affidavits may exceed the page and exhibit number limits set forth in Rule 2(H) of the Court's Individual Rules and Practices. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/13/2017) (ras) (Entered: 07/13/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>58</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY (SEE <u>59</u> Motion)</b> – MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha-Kim, Stephen) Modified on 7/17/2017 (db). (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>59</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>60</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>61</u>	DECLARATION of Jill Eggleston in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. A, # <u>2</u> Exh. B, # <u>3</u> Exh. C, # <u>4</u> Exh. D, # <u>5</u> Exh. E, # <u>6</u> Exh. F, # <u>7</u> Exh. G)(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>62</u>	DECLARATION of Shari Suzuki in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. A, # <u>2</u> Exh. B, # <u>3</u> Exh. C, # <u>4</u> Exh. D, # <u>5</u> Exh. E)(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>63</u>	DECLARATION of Eric Stein in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. 1, # <u>2</u> Exh. 2, # <u>3</u> Exh. 3, # <u>4</u> Exh. 4, # <u>5</u> Exh. 5, # <u>6</u> Exh. 6, # <u>7</u> Exh. 7, # <u>8</u> Exh. 8, # <u>9</u> Exh. 9, # <u>10</u> Exh. 10, # <u>11</u> Exh. 11, # <u>12</u> Exh. 12)(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>64</u>	DECLARATION of David Hardy in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. A, # <u>2</u> Exh. B, # <u>3</u> Exh. C, # <u>4</u> Exh. D, # <u>5</u> Exh. E, # <u>6</u> Exh. F, # <u>7</u> Exh. G, # <u>8</u> Exh. H, # <u>9</u> Exh. I, # <u>10</u> Exh. J, # <u>11</u> Exh. K, # <u>12</u> Exh. L, # <u>13</u> Exh. M, # <u>14</u> Exh. N, # <u>15</u> Exh. O, # <u>16</u> Exh. P, # <u>17</u> Exh. Q, # <u>18</u> Exh. R, # <u>19</u> Exh. S, # <u>20</u> Exh. T)(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>65</u>	DECLARATION of Katherine Myrick in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice,

		United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. A)(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>66</u>	DECLARATION of Stephanie Tell in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>67</u>	DECLARATION of Catrina Pavlik–Keenan in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>68</u>	DECLARATION of Eric Stein on Documents Referred by FBI in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exh. 1)(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>69</u>	NOTICE of Classified Filing re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
09/07/2017	<u>70</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated September 7, 2017., CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Additional Exhibits addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated September 7, 2017. Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/07/2017)
09/08/2017	<u>71</u>	ORDER granting <u>70</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages; granting <u>70</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Document. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff is granted leave to file a memorandum of law of up to thirty–five pages, and to file affidavits and exhibits in excess of the limits set forth in the Court's individual Rule 2.H. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 9/8/17) (yv) (Entered: 09/08/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>72</u>	CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> . Document filed by Saro Spadaro.(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>73</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> . . Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>74</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>75</u>	DECLARATION of Robert Leighton, Esq. in Opposition re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> .. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>76</u>	DECLARATION of Saro Spadaro in Opposition re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> .. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 Page produced by FBI, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 Italian legal documents, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 Italian legal documents, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 Email regarding visa revocation, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8 Letter from FBI to Bob Leighton, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16 Business cards of agents, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17 Letter from FBI to Anguilla)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>77</u>	DECLARATION of Massimo Canale in Opposition re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> .. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A Italian legal

		documents, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B Italian legal documents, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C Italian legal documents)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>78</u>	DECLARATION of Robert S. Groban, Esq. in Opposition re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ., <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing.</i> . Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 Amended Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 Answer to Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 Letter with FBI Fact Sheet, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8 Pages produced by FBI, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9 Pages produced by FBI)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
10/02/2017	<u>79</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Defendants' Reply</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha–Kim dated 10/2/2017. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 10/02/2017)
10/02/2017	<u>80</u>	LETTER RESPONSE to Motion addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated October 2, 2017 re: <u>79</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to File Defendants' Reply</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha–Kim dated 10/2/2017. ( <i>Plaintiff Does Not Consent to Defendants' Motion For an Extension, However, if The Court Grants Defendants' Motion, Then Plaintiff Respectfully Requests a Similar One Month Extension to File Reply Papers on His Cross–Motion</i> ). Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 10/02/2017)
10/04/2017	<u>81</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>80</u> LETTER RESPONSE granting <u>79</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. ENDORSEMENT: The Court is inclined to deny the government's request for an extension of its deadline to file an opposition/reply brief to Plaintiff's cross–motion for summary judgment. Nevertheless, because the Court is persuaded that further briefing on the parties' cross–motions for summary judgment would ultimately be useful to the Court, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the government's deadline to submit an opposition/reply is adjourned until Monday, October 9, 2017, and that Plaintiff's deadline to submit a reply is adjourned until Monday, October 23, 2017. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/4/2017) (ras) (Entered: 10/04/2017)
10/04/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 10/9/2017. Replies due by 10/23/2017. (ras) (Entered: 10/04/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>82</u>	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Stephen Cha–Kim dated 10/5/2017. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/06/2017	<u>83</u>	ORDER granting <u>82</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/5/2017) (ras) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/09/2017	<u>84</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Plaintiff's Cross Motion for Summary Judgment.</i> Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 10/09/2017)
10/23/2017	<u>85</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing.</i> . Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 10/23/2017)
02/26/2018	<u>86</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall appear for a status conference and oral argument in this matter on Wednesday, March 7, 2018 at 11:30 a.m. in Courtroom 905 of the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, New York. SO ORDERED. Status Conference set for 3/7/2018 at 11:30 AM in Courtroom 905, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 2/26/2018) (rj) . (Entered: 02/27/2018)

03/07/2018	<u>87</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the conference and oral argument currently scheduled to occur on Wednesday, March 7, 2018 at 11:30 a.m. shall be adjourned to Monday, March 12, 2018 at 2:00 p.m. (Status Conference set for 3/12/2018 at 02:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/7/2018) (ras) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/12/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Oral Argument held on 3/12/2018 re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . filed by United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice, <u>72</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and to Strike Classified Filing</i> . filed by Saro Spadaro. David John Clark and Robert S. Groban, Jr. present for Plaintiff. Stephen Seungkun Cha–Kim present for the government. As set forth on the record and in a separately docketed order, the Court granted in part and denied in part the government's motion for summary judgment, and denied Plaintiff's cross–motion for summary judgment without prejudice to renewal. The parties are directed to file a joint status update, including a proposed briefing schedule as to the remaining issues, if any, no later than March 26, 2018. (Nommensen, Sara) (Entered: 03/12/2018)
03/13/2018	<u>88</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>59</u> Motion for Summary Judgment; denying <u>72</u> Motion for Summary Judgment. On March 12, 2018, the Court held oral argument on the parties' cross–motions for summary judgment. For the reasons stated on the record, Defendants' motion is granted in part and denied in part, while Plaintiff's cross–motion is denied. Specifically, the Court found that each of the Defendants conducted an adequate search for records, and that Defendants properly relied on Exemptions 1, 3, 5, 6, 7(C), and 7(D) to withhold certain documents and to redact others. See <i>Carney v. U.S. Dep't of Justice</i> , 19 F.3d 807, 812 (2d Cir. 1994) ("[T]o prevail on a motion for summary judgment in a FOIA case, the defending agency has the burden of showing that its search was adequate and that any withheld documents fall within an exemption to the FOIA."); see also 5 U.S.C. §552(b) (FOIA exemptions). The Court determined, however, that Defendants had not sustained their burden with respect to the withholdings claimed under Exemption 7(E) because the Court was unable to determine from Defendants' largely boilerplate explanations and Vaughn Indices whether those withholdings fall within the bounds of that exemption. Accordingly, as stated on the record, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall confer and submit a joint letter to the Court no later than March 26, 2018 setting forth their respective positions as to next steps in this litigation. If either party wishes to renew their motions with respect to the documents covered by Exemption 7(E), they shall provide a brief summary of the contemplated motion and include a proposed briefing schedule as necessary. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motions pending at docket numbers 59 and 72. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/13/2018) (mro) (Entered: 03/14/2018)
03/26/2018	<u>89</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Robert S. Groban, Jr. dated March 26, 2018 re: Status of Action And Proposed Schedule. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Transcript of March 12, 2018 Oral Argument)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 03/26/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>90</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 3/12/2018 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Alena Lynch, (212) 805–0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/17/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/27/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/25/2018.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>91</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 3/12/18 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above–captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>92</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>With Respect to Exemption 7(E)</i> . Document filed by United

		States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 05/07/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>93</u>	DECLARATION of David Hardy in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Supplemental Index)(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 05/07/2018)
05/17/2018	<u>94</u>	ORDER: For the reasons set forth above, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall comply with the following briefing schedule: The parties shall file renewed cross–motions for summary judgment no later than June 7, 2018. Specifically, Plaintiff shall address the Exemption 5 issue, and both parties shall address the issue of segregability. Response briefs from each party shall be due no later than June 28, 2018; SO ORDERED., ( Cross Motions due by 6/7/2018., Responses due by 6/28/2018) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 5/17/2018) (ama) (Entered: 05/17/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>95</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State.(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>96</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>97</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment ( <i>Renewed Per Court Order</i> ). Document filed by Saro Spadaro. Responses due by 6/28/2018(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>98</u>	DECLARATION of David J. Clark in Support re: <u>97</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ( <i>Renewed Per Court Order</i> ).. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>99</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>97</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ( <i>Renewed Per Court Order</i> ). . Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/28/2018	<u>100</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/28/2018)
06/28/2018	<u>101</u>	DECLARATION of David J. Clark in Opposition re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Saro Spadaro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1. New Unredacted Production by DOJ, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2. Previous Redacted Production by DOJ, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3. Additional Pages Produced by the DOJ)(Groban, Robert) (Entered: 06/28/2018)
06/28/2018	<u>102</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>97</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ( <i>Renewed Per Court Order</i> ). . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 06/28/2018)
07/05/2018	<u>103</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/05/2018)
07/05/2018	<u>104</u>	DECLARATION of Michael G. Seidel in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Department of Justice, United States Department of State. (Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/05/2018)
12/27/2018	<u>105</u>	STANDING ORDER M10–468: The United States Attorney's Office shall notify the Court immediately upon the restoration of Department of Justice funding. (As further

		set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/27/2018) (ne) (Entered: 01/03/2019)
12/27/2018		Case Stayed (ne) (Entered: 01/14/2019)
12/27/2018		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (ne) (Entered: 01/14/2019)
03/25/2019	<u>106</u>	OPINION & ORDER re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Customs and Border Protection, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of State, United States Department of Justice, <u>97</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ( <i>Renewed Per Court Order</i> ) filed by Saro Spadaro. For the reasons state above, the government's renewed motion for summary judgment is GRANTED, and Plaintiff's renewed motion for summary judgment is DENIED. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motions pending at docket numbers 95 and 97 and to close this case. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/25/2019) (mro) Transmission to Orders and Judgments Clerk for processing. (Entered: 03/26/2019)